

THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

AGENDA

Monday, June 6, 2016

Robert J. Kibbee Conference Room (725), 205 East 42nd Street, 7th Floor

I. ACTION ITEMS:

A. Approval of the Minutes of the meeting of April 4, 2016

B. Policy Calendar:

1. CUNY Graduate School of Journalism – Request for Naming

2. The City University of New York – Policy on Freedom of Expression and Expressive Conduct

(This item is recommended for discussion and placement on the 6/27/16 regular Board of Trustees' meeting Calendar which will allow for comment at the 6/20/16 Public Hearing.)

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
APRIL 4, 2016

The meeting was called to order at 5:46 p.m.

There were present:

Committee Members:

Hon. Benno Schmidt, Chair
Hon. Philip A. Berry, Vice Chair
Hon. Valerie Lancaster Beal
Hon. Wellington Z. Chen
Hon. Freida D. Foster
Hon. Carol A. Robles-Roman
Hon. Barry F. Schwartz

Trustee Observers:

Hon. Una S. T-Clarke
Hon. Terrence F. Martell
Hon. Joseph K. Awadjie

Trustee Staff:

Senior Vice Chancellor and Secretary Jay
Hershenson
General Counsel and Senior Vice Chancellor
Frederick P. Schaffer
Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
Ms. Towanda Lewis
Mr. Anthony Vargas

University Staff:

Chancellor James B. Milliken
Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost
Vita Rabinowitz
Executive Vice Chancellor and Chief Operating
Officer Allan H. Dobrin
Vice Chancellor Judy Bergtraum
Vice Chancellor Frank Sánchez
Vice Chancellor Matthew Sapienza
Vice Chancellor Gillian Small

Cal. No.	DISPOSITION
-----------------	--------------------

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

I. ACTION ITEMS:

A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 24, 2016. The minutes were approved as submitted.

B. POLICY CALENDAR

1. CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK - APPROVAL OF SELECTION OF ENERKNOL, INC. TO PARTICIPATE IN THE START-UP NY PROGRAM THROUGH MEDGAR EVERS COLLEGE:

RESOLVED, That the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approve the selection of EnerKnol, Inc. ("EnerKnol") to participate in the Start-Up NY program (the "Program") through Medgar Evers College. The President of Medgar Evers College and the General Counsel are each authorized to execute and submit all documents that are necessary or useful to effectuate EnerKnol's participation in the Program. EnerKnol's participation in the Program shall be subject to all University and New York State requirements. All Program documents to be executed for the University shall be subject to approval as to form by the University Office of General Counsel.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
FEBRUARY 24, 2016

EXPLANATION: The Program authorizes the creation of tax-free zones on eligible university campuses in New York State for new and expanding businesses. Under New York State law five CUNY campuses, including Medgar Evers College, have been designated by the Board to participate in the Program. CUNY campuses other than the five designated by the Board may apply to host tax-free zones in competition with other universities.

Tax-free zones may be located within eligible College campuses, affiliated business incubators, and certain off-campus space affiliated with participating Colleges. Businesses locating within these tax-free zones will be generally exempt from State taxes, and the income paid to new employees of such businesses will be fully or partially exempt from State and local income taxes, for a period of ten years. In order to participate in the Program, businesses must be either a start-up or a high-tech business, must create new jobs, must not compete with any existing business within the immediate community but outside the tax-free zone, must be aligned with or further the academic mission of the host campus, and must provide positive community and economic benefits. Businesses applying to participate in the Program are subject to approval by CUNY and the NYS Commissioner of Economic Development.

The five campuses designated by the Board are permitted to include an unlimited amount of campus and affiliated space in the Program. CUNY has worked with New York State Empire State Development, which administers the Program, to solicit potential businesses on an ongoing basis, and the College identified EnerKnol as offering a particularly strong fit for its academic programs. Pursuant to University policy, EnerKnol was evaluated and recommended for selection into the Program by a committee of College and Central Office staff, and by the College President and the Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning, Construction and Management (or their designees).

2. CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK - APPROVAL OF SELECTION OF RADIATOR LABS, INC. TO PARTICIPATE IN THE START-UP NY PROGRAM THROUGH MEDGAR EVERS COLLEGE:

RESOLVED, That the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approves the selection of Radiator Labs, Inc. ("Radiator Labs") to participate in the Start-Up NY program (the "Program") through Medgar Evers College. The President of Medgar Evers College and the General Counsel are each authorized to execute and submit all documents that are necessary or useful to effectuate Radiator Labs' participation in the Program. Radiator Labs' participation in the Program shall be subject to all University and New York State requirements. All Program documents to be executed for the University shall be subject to approval as to form by the University Office of General Counsel.

EXPLANATION: The Program authorizes the creation of tax-free zones on eligible university campuses in New York State for new and expanding businesses. Under New York State law five CUNY campuses, including Medgar Evers College, have been designated by the Board to participate in the Program. CUNY campuses other than the five designated by the Board may apply to host tax-free zones in competition with other universities.

Tax-free zones may be located within eligible College campuses, affiliated business incubators, and certain off-campus space affiliated with participating Colleges. Businesses locating within these tax-free zones will be generally exempt from State taxes, and the income paid to new employees of such businesses will be fully or partially

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
FEBRUARY 24, 2016

exempt from State and local income taxes, for a period of ten years. In order to participate in the Program, businesses must be either a start-up or a high-tech business, must create new jobs, must not compete with any existing business within the immediate community but outside the tax-free zone, must be aligned with or further the academic mission of the host campus, and must provide positive community and economic benefits. Businesses applying to participate in the Program are subject to approval by CUNY and the NYS Commissioner of Economic Development.

The five campuses designated by the Board are permitted to include an unlimited amount of campus and affiliated space in the Program. CUNY has worked with New York State Empire State Development, which administers the Program, to solicit potential businesses on an ongoing basis, and the College identified Radiator Labs as offering a particularly strong fit for its academic programs. Pursuant to University policy, Radiator Labs was evaluated and recommended for selection into the Program by a committee of College and Central Office staff, and by the College President and the Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning, Construction and Management (or their designees).

Chancellor James Milliken stated that this is an exciting opportunity for Medgar Evers College (MEC), launching a couple of promising startup projects, and to do it in the Brooklyn Navy Yard. The University hopes these companies do well; however, the immediate benefit with MEC will be significant.

Following discussion, item I.B.1 and I.B.2 were approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:53 p.m.

CUNY GRADUATE SCHOOL OF JOURNALISM – NAMING OF THE MADE IN NY BROADCAST CENTER

RESOLVED, that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York approves the naming of the Broadcast Center on the third floor of the CUNY Graduate School of Journalism as the “Made in NY Broadcast Center” for a period of five years, coterminous with the duration of programmatic funding provided by the Mayor’s Office of Media and Entertainment.

EXPLANATION: Made in NY is a workforce initiative sponsored by the Mayor’s Office of Media and Entertainment in New York City. The Mayor’s Office of Media and Entertainment has pledged to grant \$1,000,000 to the Graduate School of Journalism to support workforce training offered through the School’s Center for Community and Ethnic Media (CCEM), to be paid in one sum on June 10, 2016. Subsidized training will be offered to members of the community and ethnic media, whose 350 combined media outlets represent a readership, listenership, and viewership of 4.5 million people. Such training will extend over the course of five years and will be offered in conjunction with the School’s professional training program, CUNY J+. The training across a spectrum of platforms, including print, web, video, broadcast, radio and podcasts, is aimed at elevating both the skills level and the reporting quality of journalists from this sector. The Mayor’s Office of Media and Entertainment recognizes the effective work that the Center has already done in training and creating a network for a diverse population of New York City media organizations and sees in this grant an opportunity to leverage CCEM’s effectiveness. In recognition of this grant, the School recommends naming its broadcast center the Made in NY Broadcast Center during the period of City funding.

THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK - POLICY ON FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND EXPRESSIVE CONDUCT

RESOLVED, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York hereby approves the following policy:

1. General Principles

1.1 The City University of New York (“CUNY” or “the University”) is committed to academic freedom and the free exchange of ideas and expression of all points of view for members of the University community, including individual students, faculty, and staff and recognized groups of those constituencies. Such exchange is at the core of the mission of higher education. The ideas of different members of the University community will often conflict, but it is not the proper role of the University to attempt to shield individuals from ideas and opinions they find unwelcome, disagreeable or even offensive. Although members of the University community share in the responsibility for maintaining a climate of mutual respect, concerns about civility can never be used as a justification for closing off discussion of ideas, however disagreeable or offensive they may be to some members of the University community. The appropriate response to false or offensive speech is not to prohibit it but to respond with more speech.

1.2 The freedom to express ideas does not mean that individuals may exercise that freedom in ways that are incompatible with the functioning of the University and the rights of other members of the community to freedom of expression and to a full and equal opportunity to pursue their education and to participate in the benefits of the University.

1.3 It is well established that certain forms of expressive conduct may appropriately be subject to reasonable restrictions as to time, place and manner. In particular, demonstrations, leafleting and tabling must be carried out so as to ensure the safety of individuals, the protection of property, and the continuity of the University’s educational activities and business operations. However, any such restrictions must be narrowly tailored and applied in a non-discriminatory manner and without regard to the content of the speech at issue. Similarly, meetings or forums that are open to members of the University or the public must also be conducted so as to protect their rights to participate on equal terms and without discrimination as to point of view.

2. Prohibited Conduct

2.1 Any conduct that violates the Rules and Regulations for the Maintenance of Public Order pursuant to Article 129-A of the Education Law, also known as the Henderson Rules, also violates this policy. Prohibited conduct generally includes any behavior that adversely affects or directly threatens to negatively affect the health or safety of persons or their opportunity to enjoy the benefits of the University or materially disrupts or seriously threatens to materially disrupt University functions or operations, whether or not such conduct occurs on property owned, leased or licensed by the University.

2.2 Examples of prohibited conduct that adversely affects or directly threatens to adversely affect the health or safety of persons or their right to a full and equal opportunity to pursue their education and to participate in the benefits of the University include:

- causing actual physical harm to a person;
- interfering with the freedom of movement of any person, including such person's free entry to or exit from University property or facilities;
- shouting down or otherwise preventing a speaker from delivering remarks at a program or event at a college campus or ejecting participants in a public forum or meeting because of their viewpoint;
- directing threats at a person or attempting to coerce or intimidate a person with the intent to cause that person to fear for his/her safety; and
- engaging in harassing behavior toward a person that is so persistent, pervasive or severe that it denies the person's ability to pursue an education or to participate in the activities of the University community, including not only the academic work but also the other activities and programs that occur outside of the classroom.

2.3 Examples of prohibited conduct that disrupts University functions or operations include:

- threatening to destroy or destroying University property or other public or private property located on University property;
- preventing the performance of educational or other institutional duties by any member of the University community;
- occupying or remaining on any property or facility owned or operated by the University after receiving due notice to depart; and
- using amplified sound without prior notice, or otherwise making loud noise that interferes or seriously threatens to interfere with classes, meetings, or other scheduled or routine University functions or activities.

2.4 Students who engage in prohibited conduct are subject to discipline under Article XV of the CUNY Bylaws. Employees who engage in prohibited conduct are also subject to disciplinary action as prescribed under the governing collective bargaining agreement and/or University policy. In addition, in cases in which the conduct at issue may violate the law, the

University may take appropriate action, including seeking judicial remedies or referring the matter to external law enforcement authorities.

3. Guidelines for Conducting Demonstrations

3.1 Subject to the procedures and terms set forth in campus guidelines, students and/or employees of CUNY, including but not limited to officially-recognized student and/or employee organizations, as well as persons invited and sponsored by such student and/or employee organizations, shall have access to areas of the campus owned, leased or licensed and controlled by the college that have been designated by the educational units of CUNY for demonstrations. Such designations shall be made by the president or dean of each such educational unit, with appropriate consideration given to areas in which demonstrations have traditionally been permitted, and after consultation with the college or faculty governance body and the student government association at a meeting thereof and shall be published on the web site of each educational unit. Persons and groups wishing to demonstrate in public areas not owned, leased, licensed or controlled by the University, such as sidewalk adjacent to a campus, should address their requests to the New York Police Department.

3.2 Members of the University community may not demonstrate in a manner that materially impedes or disrupts the University's educational activities (including, but not limited to classes as well as public conferences and forums) or business operations or materially interferes with the rights of others. Furthermore, members of the University community may not demonstrate in places that have not been designated for demonstrations or in places where those members of the University community are not authorized to be. In addition, demonstrators shall comply with building or facility closing times set by the College; overnight camping on University property is prohibited.

4. Procedure for Handling Disruptive Demonstrations at CUNY Facilities

4.1 At each educational unit of CUNY, the President or his or her designee, in consultation with the Director of Public Safety or designee, will determine the point at which individuals involved in a demonstration taking place on a CUNY campus continue to exhibit prohibited conduct based upon the criteria set forth in Sections 2 and 3 of this Policy.

4.2 Unless there is an imminent threat to safety or circumstances prevent such communication, the President or his or her designee or the Director of Public Safety or his or her designee will direct the demonstrators to discontinue their prohibited conduct, explain which conduct violates the Policy, and inform them how to continue their demonstration in a manner that does not violate this Policy. If the prohibited conduct continues, the President or his or her designee or the Director of Public Safety or his or her designee may take appropriate action to end the prohibited conduct, including where necessary to terminate the demonstration and to seek the immediate intervention of public safety officers or external law enforcement authorities or to seek other legal remedies.

4.3 If the conduct presents an immediate threat to persons or property, the President or his or her designee or the Director of Public Safety or his or her designee may take immediate action to address the threat, including where necessary to terminate the

demonstration and to seek the immediate intervention of public safety officers or external law enforcement authorities.

5. Leafleting, Tabling and Posting

5.1 The distribution of written materials by hand is permissible in locations that do not block entry or egress or interfere with the educational activities or business operations of a campus as designated by each of the educational units of CUNY. It is within the discretion of the educational units of CUNY whether to permit individuals and groups who are not members of the University or campus community to distribute materials and/or to give priority to members of the campus community.

5.2 The educational units of CUNY shall designate areas where members of the University community and invitees will be permitted to set up tables. Such areas must be sufficient for students and employees to communicate their message while not interfering with the college or unit's educational mission or business operations. Requests for tabling must be granted on a neutral, nondiscriminatory basis in light of the availability of space. It is within the discretion of the educational units of CUNY whether to permit individuals and groups who are not members of the University or campus community to set up tables and/or to give priority to members of the campus community.

5.3 Each college and unit of CUNY shall provide access by members of the University community to bulletin boards and systems of digital signage intended for general college use to provide information about events, subject to reasonable limitations as to size and quantity by a single organization. College or unit personnel may remove notices on a regularly-scheduled basis and may remove outdated notices but may not remove notices based on their viewpoint. It is within the discretion of the educational units of CUNY whether to permit individuals and groups who are not members of the University or campus community to have access to such facilities and/or to give priority to members of the campus community.

6. Media Access to University Facilities

News media are permitted to enter areas of the University campuses that are open to the public but are encouraged to first contact the college's media relations office so that staff may help facilitate campus visits. News media who have arranged to conduct an interview with faculty, staff or students may use a designated area over which the interviewee has authority (*e.g.*, a faculty members' own office) or for which the interviewee has obtained permission from the college (*e.g.*, a student lounge or cafeteria). Media representatives are not permitted access to nonpublic areas, such as libraries and classrooms (except to participate in educational activities at the request of the instructor), laboratories, business offices or residence halls without prior permission from the college. During emergencies, colleges may require news media to remain within a designated area for law enforcement or safety reasons. Media personnel who interfere with a college's normal operations may be asked to leave the campus. Each college may establish further guidelines consistent with this policy.

7. Publication of this Policy and Campus Regulations and Designations

This Policy shall be posted on an accessible location on the CUNY website and on the

websites of all educational units of CUNY. In addition, each educational unit shall post on its website any additional, reasonable time, place and manner restrictions on expressive conduct permitted or required by this Policy, including its designation of areas where certain expressive conduct may or may not be conducted. This Policy and any additional restrictions shall also be included in the handbook of each educational unit of CUNY relating to student activities.

8. Training about this Policy

8.1 Training of public safety personnel shall include training in the contents and implementation of this policy and of best practices in the handling of expressive conduct in a university setting, consistent with the principles of academic freedom and freedom of speech and assembly.

8.2 The leadership of student government organizations and recognized student groups, their faculty advisors and appropriate student affairs staff shall also receive training in the contents of this policy.

EXPLANATION: Recent events have raised once again the issue of whether and to what extent there are permissible and appropriate limits to the free expression of ideas on a university campus. Issues with strong emotional resonance have caused some participants to argue that speech by their ideological adversaries constitutes bullying, harassment, hate speech or is otherwise beyond the scope of protection for free speech or academic freedom. In addition, protests activities have sometimes interfered with the opportunity of students to pursue their education and on other occasions have been met by force or restrictions that infringe upon protected rights. CUNY does not have a policy affirming the importance of free expression on its campuses or describing what, if any, limits may be imposed, other than the "Henderson Rules" regarding public order. This policy fills that gap with due consideration for the purpose and nature of a university and the appropriate balance of interests recognized by the First Amendment and academic freedom.