Committee Chair Wellington Chen called the meeting to order at 5:17 p.m.

The following people were present:

**Committee Members:**
Hon. Wellington Z. Chen, Chair
Hon. Mayra Linares-Garcia
Hon. Charles A. Shorter
Prof. Karen Kaplowitz, faculty member
Ms. Alyssa Desouza, student member

**Trustee Observer:**
Hon. Chika Onyejiukwa

**Trustee Staff:**
Interim General Counsel and Vice Chancellor
Jane Sovern
Deputy to the Secretary Hourig Messerlian
Ms. Doris Wang

**University Staff:**
Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost
Vita Rabinowitz

The agenda items were considered and acted upon in the following order:

I. **ACTION ITEMS:**

A. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF APRIL 6, 2017.** Moved by Trustee Charles Shorter and seconded by Prof. Karen Kaplowitz, the minutes were unanimously approved as submitted.

B. **POLICY CALENDAR**

1. **The Graduate School and University Center – MA in Digital Humanities and MS in Data Analysis and Visualization.**

   Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost (EVC&UP) Vita Rabinowitz stated that these two separate but related programs are part of a new initiative by The Graduate Center (GC) to offer professionally-oriented and intellectually stimulating master's degrees that leverage the impressive scholarly expertise of the GC faculty by creating new programs generally not offered on the senior college campuses. Digital Humanities is a developing field of study that lies at the intersection of emerging technologies, traditional humanities disciplines, and the research methods used by scholars and other research professionals. The program in Data Analysis and Visualization teaches formal methods of data analysis and the skills needed to communicate findings in new and interesting ways. Graduates of both of these programs will be sought after by corporations in the information industries, university libraries, cultural organizations, and other non-profit sector employers.

   Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Shorter, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

2. **The Graduate School and University Center – MA in International Migration Studies.**

   EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that capitalizing on the Graduate School's research strength in immigration research, this program will provide graduates with an in-depth knowledge
of the political, economic, social, and cultural impacts of immigration. Organizations working in the areas of advocacy and human rights, and public agencies dealing with increasingly diverse immigrant populations will be interested in offering employment opportunities to graduates of the program.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Mayra Linares-Garcia, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

EVC&UP Rabinowitz pointed out that the Committee will next be presented with two programs in data science coming from two different institutions, The Graduate Center and City College. While these programs may seem ostensibly the same, they are in fact significantly different enough to warrant advancing them both to the Committee for review. In fact, data science and analytics faculty from across the University met during this academic year to discuss graduate education in big data. The carved out niche is for each institution already running such programs and for those interested in developing new programs. This is obviously the most desirable and organic manner in which to address the issue of program differentiation. In addition, the Central Office of Academic Affairs has concluded, based on both national and regional data, that there is significant enough projected employment growth in this field to justify the creation of programs across the University and particularly where they leverage specific academic strengths unique to each campus. Furthermore, both programs rely on existing courses offered for other graduate programs thus reducing the cost of running these programs.

3. The Graduate School and University Center – MS in Data Science. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that designed primarily for graduates of undergraduate computer science programs, this degree in Data Science will provide graduates with a mastery of technical topics such as data management, complex algorithms, and parallel programming. Because the program focuses on the computational and technical aspects of data science, it deliberately does not focus on specific applications or industries, and graduates will be of interest to employers in the widest variety of industries.

5. City College – MS in Data Science and Engineering. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that City College seeks to build upon its long-standing reputation by adding to its professional graduate programs in STEM areas. Given the emphasis on engineering in the curriculum, City College's undergraduate program in engineering will serve as a natural recruitment pipeline for this MS program. Government agencies are increasingly listing the STEM data science and data engineering skills as national priorities. The need to address this challenge is nationwide but is particularly acute in the New York Metropolitan area, with so much of New York's economy being information-based.

In response to questions from Ms. Alyssa Desouza on a) what is CUNY's current relationship with prospective industries, and b) whether the University has other partnerships:

City College Interim Provost Mary Driscoll stated that one of the initiatives that City College is happy to be part of is the NYC TechTalent Pipeline, which is a mayoral initiative that involves industry and also most of the universities, both public and private, in the surrounding area that offer masters in Computer Science and Data. The overarching goal of that is to increase the transfer between industries specifically in New York City and the academic programs. So while City College has just established a co-op course, it has strong programs. The College is involved in initiatives that will continue to keep its graduates working in the technology industry in New York City.
In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on what would be some of the major differences between the two data science programs at The Graduate Center and City College:

City College Interim Provost Driscoll stated that the Masters in Data Science is more theoretical than the applied technology of engineering but that would be the direction of the differences. Most of the individuals who will be in the Masters of Data Sciences and Engineering have an engineering background, will be applied to work not only in the sort of theory of big systems, but actually to work in the development manipulation of data at a more technical level.

The Graduate Center Provost and Senior Vice President Joy Connolly stated that Joshua Brumberg, the Dean for Science at The Graduate Center, has had conversations with Google about partnerships. There is a well-known pipeline initiative, called Girls Who Code. The Graduate Center also has a capstone project for this masters program that specifically encourages and fosters connections with local industry and should act as a pipeline for employment. Furthermore, The Graduate Center is involved in discussions with the provost and deans at the College of Staten Island about big data, so there is going to be more development in this area with collegial collaboration among all the CUNY college campuses.

City College Interim Provost Driscoll stated that one of the catalysts of the work that has been done at City College is the Zahn Center in Entrepreneurship, and a large number of the students are interested in developing and spinning out products in companies that are specifically in the technology area. City College will continue to see the students working in those areas with applications and other kinds of hardware and software products.

In response to another question from Trustee Shorter on whether there will be any integration with the new Cornell Tech:

City College Interim Provost Driscoll stated that City College would love to see a collaboration along the lines of the consortium of which The Graduate Center is a process among the engineering doctoral programs in the city of which Cornell University would be one. When the engineering program went to City College, the membership in the graduate consortium stayed with The Graduate Center and the faculty is very interested in seeing that the engineering students in the city are able to take advantage of resources across the city. She added that there was also a model for that in the humanities that City College was part of for many years.

The Graduate Center Provost and Senior Vice President Connolly stated that the Center for Urban Science and Progress at NYU is another potential partner that is a lateral connector with Cornell University, not just engineering specifically, but questions of urban design, big data gathering, and public policy that rely on data science as the scaffolding for what they do.

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that the University is connected with Cornell Tech through its Cornell Tech/CUNY collaboration, the Women in Technology in New York (WiTNY) program. Many of CUNY’s undergraduates are receiving scholarships to study data science as undergraduates, and some are in summer boot camps. The goal of the WiTNY project is to get more women to graduate with degrees in computer science. CUNY can only hope that some of the graduates would feed into the master's programs.
Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Linares-Garcia, and following discussion, the items I.B.3. and I.B.5. were unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

4. John Jay College – BS in Human Services and Community Justice. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that this interdisciplinary proposal is grounded in the social sciences and enhanced by professionally-oriented courses in counseling, program development, and assessment and research methods. Graduates of the program will be sought after by government, non-profit, and for-profit social service organizations.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Alyssa Desouza, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

6. City College – Transfer of Degree Granting Authority for the Ph.D. in Clinical Psychology from the Graduate School and University Center to City College. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that, established in 1980, the Ph.D. in Clinical Psychology has always been offered at, and primarily operated by City College. The program's focus is to prepare its students to become practicing clinical psychologists. At the time of the program's inception, degree-granting authority for all doctoral programs in CUNY belonged with the Graduate School and University Center. Over the past decade, the University has made the strategic decision to transfer the professional doctoral programs to the senior colleges that provide most of the teaching and administrative resources for the program. Because this is the college's first doctoral program in psychology, an amendment to City College's Master Plan is being requested of the New York State Department of Education.

In response to questions from Ms. Desouza on a) how many students are currently in the program, and b) whether any existing students will be affected by the change:

City College Department Chair of Psychology Robert Melara stated that within the five years of the program, there are 100 students currently at the Ph.D. level, and there will not be any material effect on the students because the faculty are currently housed and all the courses are taught at City College. The only difference will be that the existing students will not be commuting to The Graduate Center any longer. The only thing that takes place currently at The Graduate Center is the administrative tasks of paying tuition or receiving a diploma.

In response to a question from Prof. Kaplowitz on whether the degree will be granted by City College or The Graduate Center:

City College Department Chair of Psychology Melara stated that City College will now grant the degree instead of The Graduate Center.

City College Interim Provost Driscoll stated that City College also houses the Ph.D. in engineering so the College grants the Ph.D. in engineering, having absorbed it some years ago.

In response to a question from Prof. Kaplowitz on what was the process to have this change:

City College Department Chair of Psychology Melara stated that the change was instigated by The Graduate Center because they believed that they had too many subprograms in psychology so they asked City College to initially take on what is called the health sciences model, which means they would no longer be sending City College
faculty allocation money for teaching the courses but the College would have access to the tuition dollars. City College said that they would only do that if they could ultimately have charge of the program because there is no point in doing all this and not being able to award the degree.

City College Interim Provost Driscoll stated that this makes sense because of the College’s clinical component and accreditation through the American Psychological Association. She added that City College needs to have influence, not only on the faculty and the classes but also on the clinical experiences and work that the students do as part of their preparation.

City College Department Chair of Psychology Melara stated that the accrediting body has always been a bit confused about this division because the accreditation actually takes place at City College and the degree is administered through The Graduate Center.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Desouza, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

II. INFORMATION ITEM:

A. Medgar Evers College – The Center for Cognitive Development. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that The Center for Cognitive Development will be housed in the New School of Education at Medgar Evers College (MEC) and provide a forum for research on the many variables that affect learning among culturally and linguistically diverse populations, as well as provide services and resources to improve educational outcomes.

I. ACTION ITEMS, continued:

B. POLICY CALENDAR, continued

7. Brooklyn College – Establishment of the Feirstein School of Cinema at Brooklyn College as an Academic Department. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that Brooklyn College has a well established Department of Film that for many years offered only undergraduate degrees. In response to the ever increasing local employment opportunities, then Mayor Bloomberg encouraged CUNY to establish graduate programs in cinema to provide an affordable alternative to the private graduate programs in the region. With the assistance of funds from the city as well as the successful private fundraising done by then President Karen Gould, including a generous $5.5 million gift from Barry R. Feirstein, Brooklyn College established several graduate programs in cinema which according to the CUNY Board resolution of June 24, 2013, came to be collectively known as The Barry R. Feirstein Graduate School of Cinema, within the Department of Film. Brooklyn College now proposes to divide the Department of Film into two departments, a reconstituted Department of Film and a new department, the Feirstein Graduate School of Cinema. It is anticipated that the proposed reorganization will enhance scholarship, research, and faculty development and collaboration, as well as improving curricular development and increasing educational opportunities for students and that the Feirstein Graduate School of Cinema will house one of the highest enrolled graduate programs in Brooklyn College, which can be managed more effectively as a separate department with a particularly defined mission.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Linares-Garcia.
8. York College – MS in Clinical Trial Management.

10. School of Professional Studies – MS in Research Administration and Compliance.

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that these programs were developed by York College and the School of Professional Studies (SPS) after being identified by the Central Office as professional programs with growth potential that were not represented in the curricular offerings of any of the colleges and schools. These are programs that are underrepresented in the entire region, whereas there is some overlap between the M.S. in Clinical Trial Management that will be advanced by York College and the M.S. in Research Administration and Compliance that is being proposed by SPS. That overlap is minimal, and these programs take graduates in different professional directions. While the former, York College’s program, is aimed at students holding an undergraduate degree in fields such as biology, chemistry, or pharmaceutical science, focusing on clinical trials in pharmacology and biotechnology, the program being advanced by SPS offers broader financial and organizational aspects of managing research grants.

In response to a question from Ms. Desouza on whether any partnerships are being developed with hospitals or clinical research facilities for the program being advanced by York College:

York College Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs Panayiotis Meleties stated that the M.S. in Clinical Trial Management is leveraged by the College’s partnerships developed through the Food and Drug Administration - Northeastern Regional Laboratory, that is housed on campus, and through them and York College’s regional partnerships with the pharmaceutical industry in Long Island and Westchester, the College has placed some of the students for internships. York College has the ability to develop the program and perhaps recruit students for the program from these industries and undergraduate populations.

EVC&UP Rabinowitz noted that the School of Professional Studies M.S. in Research Administration and Compliance is also a very important step for CUNY because there is a severe shortage of qualified individuals to manage large grants in any organization, and overseeing ethical concerns compliance, intellectual property transfer, and policy development of large research projects is important. This master’s program will prepare graduates for those careers.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Linares-Garcia.

9. School of Professional Studies – BS in Health Services Administration. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that this fully online undergraduate program will provide students with the appropriate coursework in both health care management and general practices in business. Students are pursued by organizations such as hospitals, nursing homes, urgent care clinics, and managed care organizations. The fully online delivery will be particularly attractive to individuals already working full-time and looking to advance their career.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Desouza.

11. LaGuardia Community College – AS in Public and Community Health. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that this program aims to equip students with the necessary skills and
competencies required to transfer into four-year Public Health or Community Health Education programs. The Health Sciences Department at LaGuardia Community College presently offers nine majors in allied health with over 2,000 incoming students annually that often function as the first steps on the public health education ladder. This proposed program will create additional educational pathways for health science students in majors with enrollment limits. An articulation agreement with York College has been signed and other agreements are being developed.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Linares-Garcia.

12. Medgar Evers College – Establishment of the School of Education, the Department of Developmental and Special Education, the Department of Multicultural Early Childhood and Elementary Education as well as the closing of the Department of Education.

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that MEC proposes to create a new School of Education that will reassign its existing Education Department into two academic departments, the Department of Multicultural Early Childhood and Elementary Education, and the Department of Developmental and Special Education. The Education Department currently operates under the School of Liberal Arts and Education and offers one pre-professional and three professional degree programs. Creation of a new School will enhance the ability of faculty members to more effectively practice within the developmental levels of their disciplines, to conduct innovative research, and to refine and expand the professional development of practicing educators.

In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on whether this will be the first School of Education at MEC:

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that it is certainly the first School of Education, but not the first school within MEC.

President Rudolph Crew stated that the School of Education is much more comprehensive than what MEC had as a program of education. More importantly, the core reason behind it has to do specifically with the needs of Brooklyn at large, specifically central Brooklyn, with respect to teacher shortage that is looming. The fact that MEC had a number of schools in the Crown Heights and central Brooklyn areas that have not been very high-performing schools—a function of the absence of really high-quality teachers and teaching—this is not in any way to blame teachers, but rather to suggest that they need the support that could come from a more comprehensive program, and MEC wants to be able to offer that program.

In response to other questions from Trustee Shorter on a) what makes the School of Education unique and b) whether the School will take the educational component of the students to another level:

President Crew stated that the uniqueness of this effort is principally founded on the notion that the students, however poor or whatever their first language may be, all have cognitive ability far greater than what most schools have already been able to tap into, and in many cases what teachers have been taught to know how to extract. So the real question becomes how does MEC really dedicate the School to the cognitive development of students, as opposed to just simply rote learning and understanding tests, and being able to take and pass tests; but rather, how does the College developmentally create the opportunity for students to build on the cognition they come with, build upon their own cultural literacy and language, and ultimately survive in an
environment in which they are going to be asked to essentially perform on multiple levels of academic and social performance. He added that MEC understands that this will enable teachers to function with a specific tool set around how the brain works, how the issues of students’ cognitive development can be enhanced by the way teachers teach, the way they access and utilize assessment, and critically, the way that they actually show leadership in the community, helping parents as well as the students to develop cognitively. MEC is not just thinking about schooling in the context of a 6 1/2, 7-hour day, but rather schooling in the context of learning in a community.

In response to third question from Trustee Shorter on whether resources are in place to grow the program:

President Crew stated that MEC does not have all the resources in place.

In response to a fourth question from Trustee Shorter on whether enrollment is expected to grow at the School of Education:

Associate Dean Sheilah Paul stated that enrollment has already begun to grow, and MEC has been successful in getting several federal grants to develop MEC’s programs—$8 million over the last three years.

Trustee Linares-Garcia stated that one of the key points made is the fact that there is a community aspect to this. At the present time, teachers have to be full-service, and all children do not learn the same. A child that may learn in a particular way and is not getting that support can miss out on a lot, so educators need to tap into that. It is not just about teachers giving and grading tests. It is a lot more holistic. The creation of MEC’s School of Education is very important and exciting.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Linares-Garcia.

Following discussion, items I.B. 7 through I.B. 12 were unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

13. The City University of New York – Revised Advanced Placement Policy. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that this proposed policy change allows colleges greater discretion in evaluating Advanced Placement (AP) credit for transfer. Colleges may choose to grant AP credit to students with scores of 3 or higher, in line with commonly accepted nationwide practice as well as the existing SUNY policy. Previously, CUNY colleges were prevented from granting credit for courses passed with a score of 3, and this created a disadvantage for some CUNY students. This resolution would supersede the February 25, 2013 resolution on AP placement and is applicable to students entering CUNY in fall 2017. It may be applied on a case-by-case basis to any currently enrolled CUNY student.

Ms. Desouza stated that she hopes that all the CUNY colleges will grant students this credit. Students would more likely attend CUNY, especially if they could receive up to 21 credits from their AP scores.

In response to a question from Prof. Kaplowitz on whether this information will be made available to high school advisors/counselors:

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that high school advisors/counselors will be informed of this policy.
Prof. Kaplowitz stated that the explanation of this resolution, second sentence, states “colleges may choose to grant AP credit to students with scores of 3 or higher,” and the term “colleges” is rather amorphous so she would like to suggest that at least in the minutes, if not amending this, the language be revised to read, “the faculty of the discipline of each college may choose to grant AP credit” because it is the faculty who have to do this rather than a single administrator. She added that she would like the operation of this resolution to follow that path.

In response to a question from EVC&UP Rabinowitz on whether Prof. Kaplowitz is proposing that the resolution be revised:

Prof. Kaplowitz stated that as long as the Committee agrees and the minutes reflect her suggestion that the faculty of the discipline will make the decision, it would be fine.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Desouza, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

14. The City University of New York – International Baccalaureate Transfer Credit Award Policy. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that the International Baccalaureate (IB) diploma, in existence since 1968, is a rigorous two-year academic program offered at schools around the world. It aims to support schools by providing outstanding research-based education, developing both disciplinary and interdisciplinary knowledge and understanding in a global context. The courses are generally considered to have a higher level of rigor than AP courses and are linked to a high rate of college success and degree completion. More than 1.5 million students around the world have participated in the IB since its inception. As of 2015, the United States was the country with the most IB diploma students. The proposed policy brings CUNY in line with a widespread national and international practice, ensuring that high-achieving students with an IB diploma have no disincentive to attend CUNY schools.

In response to a question from Ms. Desouza on whether current CUNY students will be getting 30 credits if they completed the requirements:

Office of Academic Affairs Director of Program Review, Articulation and Transfer Ekaterina Sukhanova stated that this is a new policy so the colleges will be able to grant credit to existing students but it will not be required.

In response to a question from Trustee Shorter on whether the University has ever had a IB policy:

Ms. Sukhanova stated that the University has never had a formal, CUNY-wide policy.

In response to a question from Ms. Desouza on whether this policy will be advertised to the current students who are part of the system:

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that this policy will be publicized.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Desouza, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.
15. The Graduate School and University Center – Establishment of the CUNY School of Labor and Urban Studies. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that The Joseph S. Murphy Institute for Worker Education and Labor Studies is currently housed within the School of Professional Studies at the Graduate School and University Center to offer graduate and undergraduate degrees and certificate programs to adult students and has special relationships with local unions to provide advisement and other student services to their members. The Institute also manages both the Community Semester and the New York Union semester programs, offering internships in labor organizing to college students. The Institute also provides non-credit training programs for unions. Faculty affiliated with the Institute produce impressive scholarship in labor and urban studies. The establishment of the School will provide the fields of labor and urban studies with greater visibility in both the academic and labor communities.

In response to a question from Trustee Linares-Garcia on whether the Institute will fall under trade in terms of different skills, or more of a leadership in unions:

EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that The Joseph S. Murphy Institute currently serves both workers in health care and enables union members to move up the career ladder by getting the credentials that they need. The Institute also trains the labor leadership of tomorrow. In fact, one of the functions of the Institute is to educate the workforce, providing leadership skills for those who wish to advocate for workers and be the labor leaders of tomorrow. The Institute also has an outstanding urban studies program that educates students to produce scholarship on living in urban environments and the unique aspects of the urban experience. She added that The Joseph S. Murphy Institute within SPS seeks to expand its nature, scope, and enrollment.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Trustee Shorter, and following discussion, this item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

16. The City University of New York – Revised CUNY Research Misconduct Policy. EVC&UP Rabinowitz stated that the Central Office of Academic Affairs has reorganized its research administration division. The title of Vice Chancellor for Research is no longer used. The individual now responsible for research compliance in the central administration is the Vice Provost for Research. In addition, since research misconduct has University-wide implications—the ability to conduct research and receive federal funding depending on compliance with federal, state, and University guidelines, it has been deemed necessary that the Vice Provost for Research should actively participate in discussions with the college president and the campus research integrity officer (RIO) during inquiry stages of compliance processes and investigations. This resolution updates the current Research Misconduct Policy to insert the Vice Provost for Research, who is the University Compliance Officer, to be part of the process.

In response to a question from Prof. Kaplowitz on does this mean that there is one fewer Vice Chancellor:

EVC&UP Rabinowitz agreed that there will be one fewer Vice Chancellor.

Moved by Prof. Kaplowitz and seconded by Ms. Desouza, and following discussion, the item was unanimously approved for submission to the Board.

Upon motion duly made by Committee Chair Chen and seconded by Prof. Kaplowitz, the meeting was adjourned at 6:15 p.m.