Minutes of the Meeting of the Board of Trustees

Wednesday, November 19, 2014 at 10:00 a.m.
555 West 57th Street, 11th Floor CUCF Board Room
New York, New York 10019

Trustees Present:
Hon. Philip Berry, Acting Chairman
Hon. Wellington Chen
Hon. Noel Hankin
Hon. Marcella Maxwell

Edward Moore, Acting Section Head for Division of Budget Higher Education Unit*
Jeffrey Beal, Examiner, Division of Budget Higher Education Unit*

In Attendance:
Judith Bergtraum, Interim Executive Director, CUCF
Frederick Schaffer, General Counsel, CUNY
John Antonelli, Deputy Executive Director, CUCF
Robert Lemieux, Executive Director, Department of Design, Construction & Management, CUNY
Gwen Perlman, Director, Capital Budget, CUNY
Meghan Moore-Wilk, Director, Space Planning, CUNY
Jennifer Friedman, Director, Public/Private Partnerships, CUNY
Jeffrey Weinstein, Director, Procurement Services, CUNY
Vincent Green, Director, Vendor Integrity and Investigations, CUNY
Daniel Rothbaum, Controller, City University Construction Fund
Michael Stabulas, Managing Director, Downstate Operations, DASNY
Nancy Nichols, Special Assistant to the Fund

* Designee for Robert Megna, Executive Director of NYS Division of the Budget in Albany, attending via videoconference.

At 10:10 a.m., Acting Chairman Berry called the meeting to order, noting that a quorum was present.

Action Items

1. Approval of the Minutes of the June 10, 2014 Meeting of the Fund (No. 2183).

Acting Chairman Berry asked if there was any discussion or amendments to be made to the minutes. There being none, Mr. Berry entertained a motion that this item be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the minutes were approved.
2. Resolution of the City University Construction Fund Appointing Judith Bergtraum as Interim Executive Director of the Fund (No. 2184).

Acting Chairman Berry explained that since the Vice Chancellor of Facilities Planning also served as the Executive Director of the Construction Fund, this resolution will allow Judith Bergtraum to manage the business and contractual obligations of the Fund. Acting Chairman Berry asked if there was any discussion regarding the item. There being none, Mr. Berry entertained a motion that this item be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved.

3. Resolution of the City University Construction Fund Authorizing An Amendment to the Purchase Order for the Purchase and Installation of a New Fire Alarm System and Related Work in the Information and Technology Building at Baruch College (No. 2185).

Acting Chairman Berry called upon Judith Bergtraum for her remarks. Ms. Bergtraum explained that the Fund approved the original purchase order in May, 2013, for $900,000. Now that the design is completed, an additional $200,000 is needed, so this resolution will amend the original resolution. Trustee Hankin asked how long it takes to install such a system, and Robert Lemieux replied about 6 months, although the design takes much longer. The facility is in compliance with fire codes, as there is a fire watch currently providing that security. An automatic system will be more efficient. CUNY continually upgrades its systems throughout the campuses. There have probably been about 50 fire alarm systems installed over the last five years.

Acting Chairman Berry asked if there was any discussion regarding the item. There being none, Mr. Berry entertained a motion that this item be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved.

4. Resolution of the City University Construction Fund in Appreciation of Howard Altschuler, Deputy Executive Director/General Manager (No 2186).

Acting Chairman Berry called upon Interim Executive Director Bergtraum for her remarks. Ms. Bergtraum commented that Howard Altschuler came to CUNY as a part of the team assembled by Vice Chancellor Weinshall. At that point, DASNY was responsible for the construction of the campus buildings. Mr. Altschuler designed a structure whereby CUNY could perform its own procurement and construction work, making sure that the business of CUNY’s construction is conducted smoothly. Counsel Frederick Schaffer commended Mr. Altschuler for his professionalism and hard work. Acting Chairman Berry asked if there was any discussion regarding the item. There being none, Mr. Berry entertained a motion that this item be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved.
5. **Resolution of the City University Construction Fund in Appreciation of Iris Weinshall, Executive Director, City University Construction Fund and Vice Chancellor, City University of New York (No. 2187).**

Acting Chairman Berry remarked that it was appropriate to express the Fund’s appreciation for the remarkable efforts of Iris Weinshall, who has assumed a new position at the New York Public Library. He commended her for her hard work as the Executive Director of the Construction Fund. As Vice Chancellor at CUNY she developed and administered the Construction Fund so that it achieved its goal of advancing the University’s capital program. Her reorganization and continued support transformed the Fund into an organization with the full capacity to independently manage capital projects from planning and design through construction, reducing the backlog of deferred maintenance projects needed to address building systems.

During her tenure at CUNY she worked to bring several projects to completion, most notably the Hunter College School of Social Work, CUNY Law School, Lehman College Science Facility, Queens College’s Remsen Hall, the Bronx Community College North Hall Library, and the recently completed Advanced Science Research Center at City College, and several laboratory and critical maintenance projects improving building systems at every campus of the University. She also advanced the construction of Brooklyn College’s Performing Arts Center, the Academic Building I at New York City Tech, and renovation of the Field Building at Baruch, resulting in the development of 3.2 million square feet of space, which included the opening of 20 new facilities throughout the system.

Acting Chairman Berry asked if there was any discussion regarding the item.

Interim Executive Director Bergtraum commended Ms. Weinshall as the consummate government professional, someone who assembles a team and makes them feel like they are a part of something bigger than themselves. There being no further comments, Mr. Berry entertained a motion that this item be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved.

6. **Resolution of the City University Construction Fund Approving the Annual Certificate for Fiscal Year 2016 (No. 2188).**

Acting Chairman Berry called upon Deputy Executive Director John Antonelli, who explained that the Annual Certificate is required by law, for the purpose of laying out the schedule of debt service payments to DASNY over the course of the next fiscal year. In addition, it projects the amount of tuition that will pass through the Fund and be transferred to the City, as well as reporting the annual budget of the CUCF. Appended to the resolution is the annual audit and financial statement, which shows that the CUCF is fully compliant with all accounting requirements and policies, as well as the legitimacy and accuracy of the Fund.

Acting Chairman Berry asked whether there were any outstanding issues, and Mr. Antonelli replied that there were none. Acting Chairman Berry asked if there were any questions or...
discussion regarding the item. There being none, he entertained a motion that the resolution be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved.

7. **Resolution of the City University Construction Fund Approving the Design, Purchase and Installation of the New Building Automation System at the Administration Building at Baruch College (No. 2189).**

Acting Chairman Berry called upon Ms. Bergtraum for her remarks. Ms. Bergtraum explained that the resolution will allow a contract for $900,000 for a new Building Automation System for Baruch College’s Administration Building. This contract for services and equipment is needed to provide a functioning HVAC system in the building.

There being no further comments, Mr. Berry entertained a motion that this item be approved. On motion duly made and seconded, the resolution was approved.

**REPORTS**

**Acting Chairman’s Report**

Acting Chairman Berry requested that the Board meetings be moved back to 42nd Street, and stated that the next meeting of the CUCF Board is scheduled for Wednesday, March 11, 2015.

**Executive Director’s Report**

Acting Chairman Berry called upon Interim Executive Director Judith Bergtraum for her report. Ms. Bergtraum called on Robert Lemieux to give a presentation to familiarize the Board with CUNY’s ongoing construction projects.

Mr. Lemieux presented a series of dramatic photographs of ongoing construction for such projects as the Brooklyn College Performing Arts Center; the Klitgord building with its new electrical connection with the central plant in Namm Hall, that sends hot and chilled water into the new building; the new Advanced Science Research Center and the CCNY complex, which should be available for move in over the December/January holidays. The roofs of both buildings contain the fume hoods for the multiple laboratories, and the roof of the ASRC building has an observatory. He reported that there are still about 120 construction people on that site, most of whom are involved in final cleanup.

Acting Chairman Berry asked whether a future CUCF Board meeting could be held there. Interim Executive Director Bergtraum said it can be looked into, provided that there can be videoconference connection with Albany, and accommodation for CUNY TV to broadcast.

Other notable images were of the Colin Powell Alumni Center renovation at CCNY, financed by money Colin Powell has raised. Because of the House’s small footprint, it was necessary to build a stair tower at the back, in order to comply with New York building codes. Landmark Commission approval has been received, and Ennead Architects has been chosen to design the project. The renovation of the Medgar Evers Library in the Bedford building, the original
building of the college, will open December 15. Interim Executive Director Bergtraum credited her financial staff for their assistance in gathering funding from multiple sources to finance the project. The building will open December 1st.

Following the presentation by Mr. Lemieux, Ms. Bergtraum called on Jennifer Friedman to present a report on the CUNY 20/20 Challenge grant program, which has taken off in the last few months.

Ms. Friedman explained that CUNY 20/20 was launched by the governor in 2013 with a of $55 million capital appropriation. The initiative is structured similarly to that of SUNY, with the idea of funding for projects that incentivize long term economic development, driven by CUNY’s campuses. An application was issued during the summer of 2013, asking all the campuses to compete for the $55 million, singly or in collaboration. About 20 proposals were received, with every campus responding, some with multiple proposals. These were reviewed by a selection committee made up of representatives of CUNY, the Governor’s office and the Empire State Development Corp, and chaired by the Deputy Director of the Division of the Budget at the time, Daniel Shepard.

In July the recommendations were made to CUNY’s Interim Chancellor and the President of ESD and were announced by the Governor’s office. Eight programs were awarded, a great diversity of projects that ranged across all boroughs, including community and senior colleges. Partnerships were established among multiple campuses with private and public entities, and awards ranged from $1.5 million to $15 million. Projects crossed sectors – big data technology initiatives, and promotion of health sciences and allied health programs. Some were for simple equipment purchases while others were more complicated, like one submitted by Queensborough, that proposed purchasing or long-term leasing a site for a new allied health facility, in partnership with a health care provider who could give services to the community while training allied health students. Kickoff meetings for the programs have been held on the campuses, and scopes and budgets are beginning to be put together.

Interim Executive Director Bergtraum explained that the first initiative, for Brooklyn College and Kingsborough, is a part of a consortium with Rutgers and Stony Brook. Ms. Bergtraum said as projects progress, the Board will be shown more specific materials.

Of particular interest are programs that promote technology to improve academic success and job opportunities for students, and to leverage the Start Up NY program, another economic development initiative to create tax-free zones on campuses across the state. Investing our assets to promote programs and train our students in fields that will then lead to job placement is the main focus of the projects that were awarded in the first round. In the application, specific criteria were set forth that all the colleges should feature partnerships not only with other campuses but beyond them with private businesses or public entities, and that there had to be concrete analysis of jobs that would result from these projects. In addition, campuses were asked to leverage the capital money with other public and private funding.
Ms. Friedman remarked that CUNY 20/20 is now gearing up for round two, having received an additional $55 million funding. Once the word has been received from the Governor’s office, they will proceed with the application process, probably in the beginning of 2015.

Acting Chairman Berry remarked that questions were asked of the Chancellor in open sessions to find out what job placement assistance campuses offer. The Chancellor has indicated this will be a priority of his. The importance of internships has also been discussed. Ms. Bergtraum replied that this is a beginning, and it must be assured that these programs are successful.

As this is the first round, is there now a mechanism to show people what works, like the allied health initiative, which might be replicated at other campuses. How this process was created and where its content originated from needs to be shared with the other colleges. The campuses that were not selected are curious about why they were not selected, and will want to see examples of successful ones.

Trustee Hankin asked what role the Construction Fund had in this. Ms. Friedman replied that the CUCF will release the funding and oversee construction of the projects, but these projects have programmatic components that are completely independent from FPCM. Ownership of these programs resides with the campuses, although CUNY itself runs the awards process. Trustee Hankin suggested there should be input from private industry as well.

Interim Executive Director Bergtraum called upon Meghan Moore-Wilk, Director of Space Planning, to give a presentation about college Master Plans, those recently completed, those underway at various colleges, and those on the horizon. Ms. Moore-Wilk explained that the creation of master plans started with information provided by each college, including existing enrollment data, and five and ten-year projections by program. These are reviewed by the University office of Academic Affairs and the University Budget Office, so that the University is acting in agreement and that operating resources will be in place for them to grow. Space is examined, department by department, and a facilities condition assessment survey is undertaken for each building. The master plan study compares the college’s space needs with its space inventory and current usage.

She reviewed the recently completed master plan for Hostos Community College (2012), whose last master plan was completed in 1983. Hostos’ Allied Health and Science Building Complex in the current capital request was recommended in this master plan. The Allied Health programs educate students who are employed almost immediately upon graduation, so we want to be sure the new building has appropriate space for them. The existing biology and chemistry labs, which are decades old, need replacement, so the new facility include these labs. The existing space will be retrofitted for other uses. Funding exists to begin design; the first piece of the work includes schematic design which will deliver drawing and information to aid in the lobbying for additional funding for the project. The speaker for the City Council has dedicated money for this initiative, and the Borough President has given $2.5 million. Mr. Berry said he would like to see this accelerate. Partnering with Health Care clinics in the area is being investigated.

Master Plans also examine the classroom mix on a campus – number of rooms, number of seats per room and how the space is utilized. Recent changes in instruction include faculty assigning
online lectures, followed by classroom time spent on guided project work and problem solving. These activities require different space from the traditional rooms with tablet armchairs in a row and a professor at the front. Current pedagogy uses pods and group study areas. Another need is student space, where the students can work outside the classroom, in teams on a project or preparing materials for their assignments. Most CUNY campuses are “commuter” campuses, that demand places to gather in between classes.

Baruch’s 2008 Master Plan updated the College’s 1985 plan. It recommended the renovation of the Field Building (17 Lex). Zoning for that building allowed a “bump out” into the courtyard to add new elevators, which solved the building’s circulation problems.

At York College, a master plan was completed in 1975 – ideally a master plan has about a 10 year horizon, but there isn’t always money following that time span to update a master plan. The 2011 master plan recommended the Academic Village and Conference Center, a 165,000 square foot building that will house the school of business, student space, and a conference center that can be used by the community. This project is very important to the College as it does not have a student center and the College has requested one for decades.

The College of Staten Island’s previous master plan was in the late 1980’s, providing direction for the move to Willowbrook in 1993. Their first project identified in CSI’s 2010 master plan is the Interdisciplinary High Performance Computational Center to house their high-speed computer, classrooms and student space.

Brooklyn College Master Plan was completed in 2011; their previous master plan was done in 1995. The new master plan recommended the Roosevelt Science teaching commons, a new 180,000 GSF building and the renovation of research space in place in Ingersoll Hall.

The same kind of requirements contracts that have aided the Design and Construction group have been put into place for Planning. There is a list of five approved firms on requirements contracts for master planning, so when a funding source is identified, the colleges are able to move forward. Two studies are in process – the Baruch Library Master Plan, which will look at reconfiguring space by moving stacks around to create study space, and at John Jay, where there are still space deficits, despite the opening of the new building. At John Jay they are looking at how better to use what space they have. Two additional studies are queueing up: BMCC has submitted enrollment projections, responses from the five approved firms are in and one of them will be chosen. Medgar Evers would also like to do a master plan – they are in the process of creating their enrollment projections, and a consultant has been helping them with evaluating their programs. Once the projections are submitted and approved, a consultant will be brought on board to look at their facilities needs.

Interim Executive Director Bergtraum called upon Gwen Perlman, Director of the Capital Budget, to present information about the Capital Budget Request for fiscal years 2015-16 to 2019-20. Ms. Perlman explained that the issuing of the capital budget request was the end of a six-month process required by law, updating the capital request for the state and the city, during which time a five year plan, spanning fiscal years 2015-16 to 2019-20, is created with collaboration from each college. Meetings with each of the colleges are scheduled to review
projects and assemble the requests in a unified program. Once created, the request is brought before the Facilities Committee of the CUNY Board of Trustees in early November. At the subsequent full CUNY Board of Trustees it is presented for approval.

Certain CUNY Board approved approved priorities are followed, such as funding for projects under the State of Good Repair initiative, completing ongoing partially-funded projects, completing lab and tech upgrades, and completing projects that accomplish energy conservation, as we have a commitment to the City and State to reduce our energy consumption and footprint. There are modest new facilities requests as well. There is also the request for allocations for additional years of CUNY 20/20.

CUNY’s total request is $6.8 billion, $5.2 of which is for senior colleges, $1.6 billion for community colleges. The state share is $6 billion and the City share is $800 million. A hard dollar portion funds CUCF and DASNY salaries, but it is also a funding source for senior colleges’ minor repairs. The City Reso-A request, which is done on an annual basis, goes to City elected officials, Borough Presidents and City Council. In this request the total for Reso-A projects is $90 million.

Mr. Lemieux explained that the state fiscal year runs from April 1 through March 31, while the City fiscal year runs from July 1 to June 30. The state matches the funding the city puts up for the community colleges.

Trustee Hankin asked who was responsible for assessing the needs and intangibles, given the quickening pace and increases in student enrollment, and asked what are the opportunities in five years. Ms. Bergtraum explained that a building being planned today won’t be received for 5 or more years. The process starts with the strategic plan, the CUNY Master Plan. She reported that in his speech to the Association for a Better New York this morning, Chancellor Milliken outlined his vision for CUNY. We take the Chancellor’s vision, in which he focused on matching education and jobs in a global way, and apply capital dollars over the next 10 years.

During Chancellor Goldstein’s tenure, his vision was the Decade of Science, in which buildings and labs were reviewed. Chancellor Milliken mentioned a push for online education; interestingly 80% of students who take online courses live within the same zipcode. Since the average CUNY student commutes an hour and a half a day, taking online courses will help the commuter student better use his or her time.

Acting Chairman Berry thanked Interim Vice Chancellor Bergtraum and her staff for the presentations, giving the Trustees a better understanding of the context around capital programming.

Acting Chairman Berry called on Michael Stabulas make his report for the Dormitory Authority.

Report of the Dormitory Authority
Mr. Stabulas said he would speak about the energy conservation performance, and the Local Law 87 program, both of which concern reduction in energy consumption, and greenhouse gasses. This program for CUNY dates back to the early 1990s, when money started coming in for
projects. Lately, on the City and State level there have been pushes to be more aggressive in this area. There is about $200 million in funding for active projects, either in the study phase or in design and construction phase, with something at every campus. This is accomplished by upgrading lighting systems to more efficient ones, changing out central boiler plants, and modernizing control systems. The State issued a draft environmental plan, looking for 80% reduction in greenhouse gasses by 2050, and Mayor DeBlasio has asked for a more recent base year. This is expecting increased efficiencies and a change in the source of the energy in the first place. The City is putting money into this program, and there was an announcement in October by the Mayor’s office.

Robert Lemieux explained that greenhouse gas reductions are very expensive. They are different from energy saving projects, in which theoretically you are saving money. Funding becomes an issue.

Trustee Hankin asked whether more technology is the answer. Mr. Lemieux replied that the technology exists, but isn’t economically viable. Mr. Stabulas explained that more greenhouse gas reductions can be achieved by increasing efficiency, but not to the degree that they are looking for.

Acting Chairman Berry thanked Mr. Stabulas for his report. He expressed his thanks to the attendees from Albany.

Mr. Berry then asked if there were further questions or items to discuss. There being none, he wished everyone a happy Thanksgiving and warm holiday season. He requested a motion to adjourn. On motion duly made and seconded, the meeting of the Board of Trustees was adjourned at 11:30 a.m.